

United States Patent and Trademark Office

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/510,409	10/05/2004	Franco Codignola	163-572	7474
47888 7	7590 07/12/2006		EXAMINER	
HEDMAN & COSTIGAN P.C. 1185 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS			KUMAR, SHAILENDRA	
NEW YORK, N			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
•			1621	

DATE MAILED: 07/12/2006

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

	Application No.	Applicant(s)				
	10/510,409	CODIGNOLA, FRANCO				
Office Action Summary	Examiner	Art Unit				
	SHAILENDRA KUMAR	1621				
The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address Period for Reply						
A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPL WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING D. - Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1. after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication. - If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period. - Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statut Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailine earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).	DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION 136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be tim will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from te, cause the application to become ABANDONEI	l. lely filed the mailing date of this communication. (35 U.S.C. § 133).				
Status						
 Responsive to communication(s) filed on 22 3 This action is FINAL. 2b) This 3) Since this application is in condition for allowed closed in accordance with the practice under 	s action is non-final. ance except for formal matters, pro					
Disposition of Claims						
4) ⊠ Claim(s) 1-22 is/are pending in the application 4a) Of the above claim(s) 13-15 is/are withdra 5) ☐ Claim(s) is/are allowed. 6) ⊠ Claim(s) 1-5,8-12 and 16-22 is/are rejected. 7) ⊠ Claim(s) 6 and 7 is/are objected to. 8) ☐ Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/o	wn from consideration.					
Application Papers	•					
9) The specification is objected to by the Examina 10) The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a) accomposed as a composition and applicant may not request that any objection to the Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correct 11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examination.	cepted or b) objected to by the E e drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See ction is required if the drawing(s) is obj	e 37 CFR 1.85(a). ected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).				
Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119						
 12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f). a) All b) Some * c) None of: 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received. 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)). * See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received. 						
Attachment(s) 1) Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) 2) Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) 3) Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08 Paper No(s)/Mail Date 10/5/04.	4) Interview Summary Paper No(s)/Mail Da 5) Notice of Informal Pa 6) Other:					

Application/Control Number: 10/510,409 Page 2

Art Unit: 1621

DETAILED ACTION

This office action is in response to applicant's communication filed on 6/22/06.

Claims 1-22 are pending in this application.

1. Applicant's election with traverse of Group I, claims 1-12 and 16-22 in the reply filed on 6/22/06 is acknowledged. The traversal is on the ground(s) that the alleged distinct inventions are not independent in that the glycols and polyglycols of claims 1-13 and 16-22 are used to make the polymers and polymer uses defined by claim 14-15. This is not found persuasive because the glycols and polyglycols can also be used as ultraviolet light absorbers, as evidenced by EP 0 191 582.

The requirement is still deemed proper and is therefore made FINAL.

Priority

2. Receipt is acknowledged of papers submitted under 35 U.S.C. 119(a)-(d), which papers have been placed of record in the file.

Information Disclosure Statement

3. The information disclosure statement (IDS) submitted on 10/5/2004 is in compliance with the provisions of 37 CFR 1.97. Accordingly, the information disclosure statement has been considered by the examiner.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112

- 4. The following is a quotation of the second paragraph of 35 U.S.C. 112:
 The specification shall conclude with one or more claims particularly pointing out and distinctly claiming the subject matter which the applicant regards as his invention.
- 5. Claims 10-12 and provides for the use of the compound, but, since the claim does not set forth any steps involved in the method/process, it is unclear what

method/process applicant is intending to encompass. A claim is indefinite where it merely recites a use without any active, positive steps delimiting how this use is actually practiced.

Claims 101-2 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 101 because the claimed recitation of a use, without setting forth any steps involved in the process, results in an improper definition of a process, i.e., results in a claim which is not a proper process claim under 35 U.S.C. 101. See for example *Ex parte Dunki*, 153 USPQ 678 (Bd.App. 1967) and *Clinical Products, Ltd.* v. *Brenner*, 255 F. Supp. 131, 149 USPQ 475 (D.D.C. 1966).

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

6. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless -

- (b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.
- 7. Claims 1-5, 8-9 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Golborn et al (US 3,935,162).

Golborn et al, column 5, various compounds on lines 35-60, anticipate instant claimed compounds when in the instant claims, n is 0, R is phenyl, R1 is H, m is 1,2, 3 or 4.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

- 8. The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:
 - (a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and

Application/Control Number: 10/510,409

Art Unit: 1621

the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.

- 9. The factual inquiries set forth in *Graham* v. *John Deere Co.*, 383 U.S. 1, 148 USPQ 459 (1966), that are applied for establishing a background for determining obviousness under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) are summarized as follows:
 - 1. Determining the scope and contents of the prior art.
 - 2. Ascertaining the differences between the prior art and the claims at issue.
 - 3. Resolving the level of ordinary skill in the pertinent art.
 - 4. Considering objective evidence present in the application indicating obviousness or nonobviousness.
- 10. Claims 16-22 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over DE 3824 961 or Branchaud et al (J. org. Chem., 1987).

Instant claims are directed to a process of making N-(Hydroxymethyl) benzamide, by reacting benzamide with formaldehyde in slightly basic media.

DE'961, page 3, example 1, or Branchaud et al, page 5477, 3rd paragraph, teach a similar process of making N-(Hydroxymethyl) benzamide, by reacting benzamide with formaldehyde in slightly basic media. The difference between the reference and herein claimed process is that the references are not preparing multiple -CONH-CH₂OH substituted phenyl compounds.

It would have been prima facie obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made to modify the process of DE'961 or Branchaud et al by starting with multiple CONH_{2 substituted} phenyl compound and reacting with formaldehyde, because the process is analogous, with the reasonable expectation of achieving a successful product containing multiple -CONH-CH₂OH substituted phenyl compound, absent evidence to the contrary.

Application/Control Number: 10/510,409 Page 5

Art Unit: 1621

11. Claims 6-7 are objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the

base claim and any intervening claims.

12. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to SHAILENDRA -. KUMAR whose telephone number is

(571)272-0640. The examiner can normally be reached on Mon-Thur 8:00-5:30, Alt Fri.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's

supervisor, Thurman Page can be reached on (571)272-0602. The fax phone number

for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the

Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for

published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR.

Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only.

For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should

you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic

Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a

USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information

system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

SHAILENDRA - KÚMAR Primary Examiner

Art Unit 1621

S.Kumar 7/4/06